

Agenda – Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 2 – Senedd

Meeting date: 8 May 2019

Meeting time: 09.30

For further information contact:

Martha Howells

Committee Clerk

0300 200 6565

SeneddCWLC@assembly.wales

- 1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest**
(09.30)
- 2 Count me in! – Inquiry into the role of arts and culture in addressing poverty and social exclusion: classical music**
(09.30–10.30) (Pages 1 – 19)
Leonora Thomson, Managing Director, Welsh National Opera
Michael Garvey, Director, BBC National Orchestra & Chorus of Wales
- 3 Count me in! – Inquiry into the role of arts and culture in addressing poverty and social exclusion: ProMo–Cymru**
(10.40–11.20) (Pages 20 – 21)
Arielle Tye, Development Manager, ProMo–Cymru
- 4 Paper(s) to note**
(11.20)
 - 4.1 Correspondence with the Minister for International Relations and the Welsh Language regarding the impact of Brexit on the arts, creative industries, heritage and the Welsh language**
(Pages 22 – 29)
 - 4.2 Correspondence with the Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism regarding Ofcom requirements**
(Pages 30 – 31)



4.3 Correspondence with the Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism regarding the National Librarian for Wales recruitment exercise

(Pages 32 – 35)

5 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 (vi) to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of this meeting

6 Private debrief

(11.20–12.00)

Document is Restricted

Submission from Welsh National Opera to the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Select Committee on “The role of Arts and Culture in addressing poverty and social exclusion”

Background to WNO’s Engagement Programme

Having grown from a voluntary singing ensemble in 1946, Welsh National Opera’s mission has always been about challenging traditional views of what opera can be in the heart of Wales’s community. As the company’s vision and reach has expanded, we have built up an internationally recognised reputation to reach those who are often excluded from taking part in the arts. Our Youth and Community Programme is over 45 years old and was initially established to create more opportunities for the communities across South Wales to access opera beyond attending the theatre; particularly in communities that wouldn’t otherwise have the chance.

Our youth, community and digital work, led by our Director of Partnerships and Engagement, has grown extensively over the last three years with a remit to deliver across the whole of Wales and England. We now have one of the largest outreach programmes of all national opera companies in the UK, reaching over 37,000 participants in the last financial year, across 74 projects, reaching a further 58,000 people through our digital light exhibition in 2016. In 2017 our touring Virtual Reality ‘pop up opera’ reached just under 12,000 people and also toured to the Hong Kong Arts Festival. For 60% of these visitors, this was their first taste of opera. We receive an average of 20,000 downloads to our primary school singing teaching resources per month and will be expanding this offer to include secondary school resources in addition to training resources for music workshop leaders.

Our aim over the next four years is to create even more opportunities for harder to reach communities to actively engage with opera. Be it through direct participation in workshops or events, or by using digital technologies to author their own content, inspired by opera. Our digital programme has grown to the extent that we can use our expertise to encourage groups to harness their creativity and share this with wider networks around the world, connecting the otherwise unseen smaller communities of Wales with the international stage.

Wales Millennium Centre
Bute Place Cardiff CF10 5AL

Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru
Plas Bute Caerdydd CF10 5AL

T 029 2063 5000
F 029 2063 5099
wno.org.uk

Registered in England & Wales
Cofrestrwyd yng Nghymru a Lloegr 454297
Registered Charity
Elusen Gofrestredig 221538

With this expanding remit, our youth, community and digital strategy also focuses heavily on how we can effect change on the ground as cultural ambassadors. How we can reach out to communities and involve them in our projects whilst constantly pushing the boundaries of what can be achieved by opera. How we can be relevant whilst dealing in an art form that is defined by its history, where we create lasting impact in cities we only visit for a few days at a time.

Culture Poverty and Social Inclusion

On this basis in 2014 we made the decision to work in communities that had previously be defined as Community First areas in Wales, and those that ranked high on the deprivation index in England. The focus was on expansion of our offer (reaching more people across broader geographical boundaries), and therefore increasing participation and the promotion of inclusive practice. We have extended our offer in include early years through to older people in retirement and everyone in between; and we no longer run projects that are time limited instead programming opportunities to engage with WNO throughout the year. By expanding the programme in this way we have achieved deeper, more meaningful relationships with the communities in the cities we tour, that aren't simply about one off activities, but that promote sustainable outcomes to reinforce the wider benefits of cultural participation, particularly in areas of low engagement.

To support this approach and to develop long term partnerships on the ground we have a team of producers based at local venues in a series of hub areas in Wales and England. There is a team at our home theatre at the WMC in Cardiff working across South Wales including the Valleys and Swansea. A team of 3 based at Venue Cymru in Llandudno working across the North East Wales area, a team of 2 in Birmingham, and soon to be a Producer based in Southampton working across the South West of England.

The driving force of this provision is around regular and sustained access. We run weekly schools and special schools programme in areas of Cardiff and the South Wales Valleys that rank highly on the deprivation index or that do not receive any music provision directly in the school. This means that every child from these schools will get to work with Welsh National Opera for over 12 months and will attend an open dress rehearsal and meet some of the cast. We also offer the children and their family subsidised tickets and have a wider discounted ticket scheme for young people under 30 years.

Our regular schools programme currently runs in 17 schools and 8 of these have been assigned because they are in areas of deprivation: Splott, Ely, Llanrumney, Maesglas and Pentwyn. We are also offering this programme in Valleys schools in in Pontypridd, Abercarn and Newport and we will be expanding to more Valleys schools in the next financial year. Through this programme we offer places to young people who are based in the formerly assigned Community First areas, who want to take part in our youth opera sessions, but without support wouldn't have the opportunity to join in. To remove barriers to access completely, we provide transport each week for the young people by way of mini bus, waiver the fees and provide a chaperone and youth opera buddy, so that they instantly feel part of the group. This has enabled us to diversify the group of young people we work with and open up youth opera to a much larger pool of young singers, particularly those from challenging socio economic backgrounds. This opportunity will also extend to young people of 18 – 21 years who are not in conservatoire training and who again are from areas that are socio-economically challenged or from BAME communities, who will have the chance to be part of our youth artist programme, where they will not only have focussed training programme around singing and performance skills but will also have the opportunity to shadow back stage areas such as stage management, lighting, set design, costume and wigs and make up.

In the last 3.5 years we have worked with around 1,640 pupils across our schools programme. Teachers complete feedback forms each year explaining the benefits of the programme;

"It's hard to put into words all the benefits. It's been huge. It's broadened the children's horizons. They have a better understanding of music, language, emotions... the world. They have developed creatively and have improved discipline... They now consider bigger dreams – not only considering music but to consider jobs they've heard from the lessons – i.e. art, literature and psychology – La bohème. My class have improved their attendance in school this year. I consider that WNO lessons have had an impact on this too. Children look forward to the lessons. It has had such an impact on our school. We feel extremely fortunate to have been made a part of such a wonderful scheme."

Looking to the future of the regular schools programme we aim to target areas described as "most deprived" on the WIMD with preference given to specific schools whose pupil population has higher percentages of FSM than the national average, whilst also taking into consideration targets surrounding geographical location, ethnic diversity, Welsh language use and current music provision and access.

We run a similar programme in our North Wales hub and recruit young people for youth opera from Wrexham, Mold, Bangor and Caernarfon.

As well as weekly provision we also run a 'special projects programme'. In South Wales this has been specifically targeted to Bute Town through our Family Concerts programme and the Valleys and Swansea for wider access, where in the last two years we have used digital technology and composition as a way of engaging young people, involving over 850 pupils. 5 of these projects have taken place in areas of Pontypridd, Abercarn, Abercanaid, Cyfarthfa, Ystrad Mynach and Merthyr. Our School dress rehearsals are open to primary and secondary pupils (production dependent) for free, with free travel provided for the majority of schools where appropriate, over 2,530 pupils have attended these rehearsals over the last 3 years.

Recently in Swansea we have worked with the 850 intergenerational participants in Townhill, Sketty, Bryn Mellin, Castle Ward, St Helens and Morrison, on a project bringing young people together with older people experiencing Dementia in partnership with Dementia Friends and Age Concern.

Across our special projects programme we have entered into a five year relationship with the Refugee Council in Wales and we will work with charities including Amnesty International, Red Cross, Forget Me Not Chorus, Pen Cymru and Save the Children Cymru and National partners such as the Children's Commissioner for Wales amongst others as part of our Freedom programme. This has enabled us to introduce young people to issues around human rights; they have created their own commission around the issue that will be performed at the Senedd later this month.

A recent project with the Oasis Centre in Cardiff working with up to 20 refugee participants who have been writing their own music and songs working with WNO will be performed in July by members of the WNO orchestra and chorus; and we are welcoming them, their friends and families to an open music event at WNO next week, which will also be supported by free transport.

We are running an artist in residence programme working with 4 refugees who have been developing a piece called 'Beyond the Rainbow', working with musicians and writers in our studio and also offering opportunities for refugees to work as producers and project managers across our youth and community programme. This opportunity will continue for the next three years.

Around health and well-being, we are working in partnership with the Heath Hospital, Llandough and Morriston hospital in Swansea delivering weekly singing sessions with older patients and their families.

How effective has the Welsh Government been in improving participation in and access to culture for people in poverty?

The Baroness Kay Andrews' report 'Culture and Poverty', highlighted excellent practice across the arts and heritage sector in terms of tackling poverty, particularly cultural poverty, but also identified areas where real partnership could be brokered towards future change. Our inclusion in this report has been influential when seeking new partnerships for our continued programme in the Valleys.

The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 has also shaped some of our thinking around how we engage with young people and the opportunities we offer them particularly around skills development and around the objectives of our more recent programme working with hospitals.

Working with organisations like schools and head teachers, training organisations like Cultural and Creative Skills Council with whom we have had a five year partnership, and more recently the Refugee Council for Wales and the Children's Commissioner has helped us to see how we can better support young people who may be excluded from the arts or living in extreme poverty.

Barriers

A major barrier for communities accessing our provision is transport links, particularly when we cover such a wide geographical spread across Wales. The continued investment that is needed to support sustained community engagement across our hub programmes is significant, and benefits cannot always be measured in terms of tackling poverty or supporting job creation opportunities; and whilst we provide free transport for both our youth opera programme, dress rehearsal programmes and in some cases to attend our shows, this has considerable cost attached to the organisation. Partnership programmes around improved transport links or providing affordable and connected transport across Wales but particularly to Valleys communities and across North Wales would be a huge benefit. Simply travelling from North to South, a journey which our producers regularly undertake can take almost a day, which has an impact on resource and capacity. Equally, some of our youth opera singers in North Wales travel over 40 miles to access provision.

Another barrier, in terms of infrastructure, is that austerity has led to local music services being decimated and therefore that element of the infrastructure is now very patchy. This means that for arts organisations who have something to offer, it can be very difficult to know where to access those who need our work most. For example, in our work in Birmingham and Southampton, we liaise closely with the Music Education Hubs there, and a structured approach is taken to provision from arts companies across the cities. This ensures that we are not duplicating work, and also are going into areas where the need is greatest. It is also worth pointing out that the significant decrease of individual music tuition formerly provided by all music services is leading to a crisis situation where only children from privileged backgrounds will be able to learn musical instruments, thus actively working against the government's wish for equality of access to the arts.

A challenge for us, rather than a barrier per se, is that there is a dearth of trained amateurs to lead this work. We are very lucky in having some brilliant freelancers who we work with, but they are few and far between and in demand. We have taken a proactive approach to this and have engaged with a programme formed by the Spitalfields Festival to train new amateurs; we are now in early stages of planning of a project to create a similar programme in North Wales, and then Birmingham, in collaboration with the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama.

A final challenge for us is that there is a massive demand for our work. Whilst this could be seen as a "nice to have" problem, it actually has opened our eyes to what a responsibility we and other companies have in terms of this type of provision. We know this stuff works (although see evaluation below) and despite constantly being on the look-out for funding opportunities, we have to prioritise where we go,

What impact has the Welsh Government's Fusion programme had on using culture to tackle poverty?

Whilst we recognise the significant potential of the fusion programme and have consulted with the team and attended an information session, we have not as yet looked to directly benefit from the programme in terms of funding through a Local Authority partner. We can see where this support would benefit our programme particularly in North Wales around the volunteering opportunities that we are beginning to set up and which could be linked to qualifications and accreditation, but in the shorter term we have been working hard to establish this programme and the overall strategy before making a case for funding.

Some of partners on the North Wales programme, Can Sing for instance, have benefited from the programme and we have seen the impacts first hand and through verbatim evidence,

particularly around highlighting the benefits of cultural participation for young people and the communities they are from, however, we haven't had direct access to formalised evaluation and monitoring at this stage to understand how this benefit is measured and across what baseline.

There is limited published evidence available around the programme and its impact. Greater visibility of the scheme could achieve improved collaboration particularly amongst the national arts organisations and we believe we need to take a more active part in seeking out how we can work with partners to champion this approach and be more involved in future should the opportunities become available to be part of the Fusion programme.

Evaluation

There have been many programmes trying to assess formally the impact of arts education on young people's life chances but there is still no nationwide method of evaluation. We do evaluate our work – by form-filling, vox-pops and other qualitative methods - and have our own Quality Principles that we adhere to, and for the assessment of practitioners we use Artworks' principles (a major partnership programme on participatory practice we are part of funded by the Paul Hamlyn Foundation). We have recently engaged an evaluator to work on our Schools programme so it will be interesting to see whether there is a more robust method that we can use into the future. However, there is very little doubt, from the feedback we get from partners such as Head Teachers that our work is fulfilling a valuable role, increasing the confidence, discipline and well-being of the people we interact with, and thereby making a significant difference to their chances in life.

Leonora Thomson

Managing Director, WNO

3 May 2019

Agenda Item 3

Written Evidence prepared for the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee's inquiry into The role of the arts and culture in addressing poverty and social exclusion.

Prepared by Arielle Tye, Development Manager, ProMo-Cymru, 30th April 2019



ProMo-Cymru has a long history of working with young people from disadvantaged and vulnerable groups.

We deliver/have delivered a wide range of projects that engage young people in cultural activities and provide them with opportunities to include:

- We have delivered theSprout.co.uk Cardiff's online news and info site for young people for 10 years. Young people create their own stories and content, review shows and share their opinions.
- [EVI is a cultural centre based in Ebbw Vale](#), situated in one of the most economically deprived areas in Wales.
- We worked with local artists in Cardiff to set up [The Abacus](#) a pop up, community led art and events space in 2014-2016.
- We work with both the WMC and National Museum to support them to engage young people through cultural activities.

We strongly agree that art and culture can play an important role in addressing poverty and social exclusion.

There are some good projects going on that are improving access and participation. We work in partnership with The National Museum and WMC and can see progress in this direction. For example:

- The WMC have set up a youth led radio station. This is a good example of engaging young people on their level into the WMC. This is a co-produced, community led approach. It's effective because it celebrates and gives prominence to young people's own culture.
- The National Museum are delivering a National Lottery Heritage Fund project 'Hands on Heritage' which aims to change how the Museum engages with young people.

However more often we see a focus towards encouraging people to take part in the arts, culture and heritage that is already on offer. From my experience, much of what is on offer is not accessible or attractive to many people living in poverty and it does not reflect their culture. In 2017 we held a youth event at

the National Museum of Wales, it was largely attended by BAME young people and many of them asked 'where is the museum?'

There is a place for schemes to encourage young people and their families to visit museums, watch operas etc, but to achieve effective inclusion and participation the focus needs to shift further towards working with young people and their families to create cultural activities that are relevant to them. For something to be truly accessible, people need to recognise their own culture being reflected within these institutions. Both the Abacus and EVI provide excellent case studies of this working in practice. The EVI has a footfall of 5000 visitors a month, engages 'people in poverty' in cultural activities. It generates 85% of its own income, yet receives no WG or Arts Council funding.

From my experience the big institutions are a long way from being able to do this work. They struggle to work out how to effectively engage people at their level and create things that are appealing and relevant to them. It's not about getting more 'people from poverty' to attend an exhibition, but more around supporting their own culture to have prominence.

The work that I see that is accessible to 'people in poverty' is coming from community led grassroots organisations that are very close to these groups of people. These organisations have skills and expertise in community engagement work. Stronger partnerships and collaborations need to be forged with these organisations to achieve equity of access.

I work with young people who have disengaged from mainstream education, yet they spend hours lyric writing, rehearsing and practicing their music and rapping. They perform, collaborate and tell stories through their music. They are deeply involved in cultural activities, yet this often doesn't move beyond a grassroots level.

Effective community engagement work requires a bottom up approach. The first step is engaging people on their level, within their own communities. Listening to them and acting on what they want to do. *We do see projects and programmes that do this and want to see more of this.*

We have no experience of the WG Fusion Programme.

Eluned Morgan AM

Minister for International Relations and the Welsh Language

Welsh Government

2 April 2019

Dear Eluned,

The impact of Brexit on the arts, creative industries, heritage and the Welsh language.

Thank you for agreeing to answer questions which arose during the Assembly Plenary session on 13 March 2019 following my statement on the impact of Brexit on the arts, creative industries, heritage and the Welsh language.

I know you share my concerns that leaving the European Union will have a hugely detrimental effect on our creative industries, rural economy and ability to promote Wales globally.

My statement addressed the issues raised in the [report](#) of the inquiry into this issue carried out by the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee published in November 2018.

I am grateful for the detailed [response](#) to the Committee's recommendations you provided in January 2019. Some of the issues which were raised in the Plenary session have been addressed in your response, such as the need to have continued membership of Horizon 2020, Erasmus+ and Creative Europe. However, there are some other points which would be useful to clarify.

Welsh language

Our inquiry report details the concerns we have about the risk to the Welsh language if the rural economy suffers, particularly from a change in the level of funding support via the Common Agricultural Policy framework.

These concerns were raised by David Melding AM and Suzy Davies AM after my statement. David commented on the risk to Welsh speaking rural economies from agricultural tariffs and the need mitigate the costs in the short term, while Suzy noted that the Welsh language was not given due

regard in the Government's policy proposals for agricultural support in 'Brexit and our land'.

During our inquiry, we heard from Meirion Prys Jones, the former Chief Executive of the Network to Promote Linguistic Diversity and also the Welsh Language Board, who called for the maintenance of the Welsh Language to be named as one of the Government's principles in this policy area.

In response to our recommendation on assessing the risks to Welsh-speaking communities from Brexit, you said:

we are committed through the changes proposed in the recent consultation 'Brexit: Our Land' to keeping farmers on the land, and to working with them to create a better, more prosperous future for their sector.

The Committee have since discussed the need to highlight the risk to the Welsh language as a result of the threat to our agricultural sector from Brexit. We are recommending the Welsh Government identifies the maintenance of the Welsh language as a key principle underpinning its support for delivering the public goods scheme.

Will the maintenance of the Welsh language be named as one of the 'key principles to guide future support' as set out in Chapter 4 of ['Brexit and Our Land'](#)?

Welsh language impact assessments

In your response to our report, you say:

We have already committed to undertaking a Welsh Language Impact Assessment on our final proposals following consideration of consultation responses [to 'Brexit and Our Land']. We will do likewise for other policy changes that will be required as a consequence of Brexit.

However, Suzy Davies AM questioned whether Welsh language impact assessments were an integral part of the Welsh Government's process of preparing for Brexit, in particular, for a 'no deal' Brexit scenario. She is concerned that this issue has not been answered directly in evidence provided to other Assembly Committees.

Please can you provide evidence that the Welsh Government has carried out a Welsh language impact assessment on your Brexit policies and 'no deal' scenario preparations?

Finally, I note from your response to our report that you have been in correspondence with the Welsh Language Commissioner in relation to the potential impact of Brexit on the Welsh language.

Please can you provide the Committee with a summary of your discussions with the Welsh Language Commissioner and any agreed actions?

Modern languages

During the debate following my statement Delyth Jewell AM and Rhianon Passmore AM commented on the importance of studying modern languages and their concerns at the declining numbers of pupils who are opting to do so. This was also raised in our inquiry. It was suggested that schools in Wales will struggle to recruit modern language teachers as a result of Brexit. Also, in the event that the UK is not a part of the Erasmus+ scheme it will mean students are deprived of a valuable cultural learning experience in Europe.

I know that on the same day I made my statement, the Minister for Education, Kirsty Williams AM, was asked about the BBC poll which found that 'Wales has seen a bigger decline in pupils learning foreign languages than in any other part of the United Kingdom'. She responded that over £2.5 million has been invested on the Global Futures plan, to enable learners to understand the importance of languages and, under Wales's new curriculum, learners will experience languages from an earlier age.

The Committee noted your response to our report recommendation on this issue:

The approach within the new curriculum aims to address this decline however it is also important that we assess the impact that Brexit may have on the current situation in relation to language learning in schools and universities in Wales.

Please can you provide an update on the work being done to assess the impact of Brexit on the current situation in relation to language learning in schools and universities in Wales?

I made a commitment to Suzy Davies AM to follow up on her query about the Welsh Conservatives' campaign for a 'trilingual Wales' which was launched when she was opposition spokesperson on education. She said 'That general principle was noted by the Minister for Education at the time, and it became part of Government policy, so I would like to receive some assurance from the Minister, perhaps, that that remains the case, in terms of Government policy'.

Please can you confirm that the Wales as a trilingual nation policy continues to be endorsed by the Welsh Government?

Please can you respond to the questions highlighted in this letter by **26 April** so that we can inform our stakeholders?

Yours sincerely,



Bethan Sayed

Chair of the Committee



Our ref MA-P/EM/1545/19

Bethan Sayed AM
Chair, Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA

29 April 2019

Dear Bethan,

The impact of Brexit on the arts, creative industries, heritage and the Welsh language

Thank you for your letter of 2 April further to the statement you made in Plenary on 19 March on the Committee's report on the impact of Brexit on the arts, creative industries, heritage and Welsh language.

You have raised a number of questions with regard to the Welsh language and modern languages, which I answer in turn. Where relevant, the responses represent the views of the Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs and the Minister for Education and Skills for the relevant matters which fall in their respective portfolios.

Welsh Language

Question 1: *Will the maintenance of the Welsh language be named as one of the 'key principles to guide future support' as set out in Chapter 4 of 'Brexit and Our Land'?*

Response: The Minister for EERA will be making a formal statement on the outcome of the Brexit and our land consultation in May, which will contain further detail on future support proposals.

Question 2: *Please can you provide evidence that the Welsh Government has carried out a Welsh language impact assessment on your Brexit policies and 'no deal' scenario preparations?*

Response: In relation to *Brexit: Our Land*, the Minister for EERA has clarified it is too soon to carry out impact assessments at this point until policy proposals have been developed

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre:
0300 0604400

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay
Caerdydd • Cardiff
CF99 1NA

Gohebiaeth.Eluned.Morgan@llyw.cymru
Correspondence.Eluned.Morgan@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

further. We have committed to undertake a full range of impact assessments in due course, including for the Welsh language.

We will do likewise for other policy changes that will be required as a consequence of Brexit.

As I have previously noted, our approach in terms of assessing the risk of the impact of Brexit on Welsh speaking communities and on the Welsh language more generally will be to do so on a continuous basis as part of our *Cymraeg 2050* strategy programme monitoring.

The Welsh language exists within the context of communities of speakers. *Cymraeg 2050* is clear that the continued vitality of Welsh in communities where there are high percentages of Welsh speakers is inextricably linked to the sustainability of those communities as economically viable places in which Welsh speakers can remain, or return, if they so wish. As such, assessing the potential impact of Brexit on the demography of the Welsh language and on the use of Welsh in those communities can only meaningfully be undertaken as part of wider modelling of the resilience of those communities to Brexit. To this end we have been working with stakeholders through the ERA Roundtable Forum to look at the potential geographic vulnerability of communities across Wales to a variety of Brexit scenarios.

Question 3: *Please can you provide the Committee with a summary of your discussions with the Welsh Language Commissioner and any agreed actions?*

I agreed with the previous Welsh Language Commissioner that Brexit should be a standing item in our quarterly meetings. I will wish to continue those discussions with Aled Roberts. The Commissioner's Office has shared with us evidence it has presented to various Assembly Committees and policy consultations.

Modern Languages

Question 4: *Please can you provide an update on the work being done to assess the impact of Brexit on the current situation in relation to language learning in schools and Universities in Wales.*

Response: Global Futures is Welsh Government's plan to improve and promote modern foreign languages in Wales. The approach is led by a steering group which includes a diverse range of stakeholders including Universities, The British Council, regional consortia and language institutes. Members of the group have been involved in research into the effects of Brexit on language learning both in Wales and across the UK as a whole. These include a paper by the British Council on '*Languages for the Future*' (2017) and a paper by Claire Gorrara Professor of French Studies at Cardiff University, '*Speaking from Wales: Building a Modern Languages Community in an era of Brexit*' (2017). The British Council runs an annual Language Trends Survey which assesses attitudes and approaches to learning languages in Wales and which includes questions on the impact of Brexit. The analysis from these surveys and studies is shared with all members of the group and forms an evidence base for decisions made in taking forward the Global Futures plan. These have included developing the student mentoring programme to include a greater focus on intercultural skills and proposals to extend the teaching of international languages in primary schools as part of the new curriculum.

Erasmus+

Wales has benefitted significantly from Erasmus and the Welsh Government wants to continue to be a full member of the programme, or whatever scheme replaces it. The UK Government has failed to give assurances that we will be able to continue to participate in

Erasmus+. That is why we will continue to make the case for our universities, colleges and schools to be a full part of the programme and make sure our European links continue, despite Brexit.

The EU has published its proposed regulations covering the next Erasmus scheme from January 2021 to 2027. This provides a framework for third country participation. The UK Government has sought the view of the Devolved Administrations on these proposals. The Withdrawal Agreement – if agreed – provides for the UK to continue to participate in Erasmus to the end of the current scheme in December 2020. In the event of a “no deal” scenario, the UK Government underwrite guarantee would apply. It is the UK Government’s responsibility to deliver this guarantee and its extension. It is unclear as to the stage negotiations have reached with the Commission on this matter.

The UK Government holds regular discussions with the Devolved Administrations to update on progress with plans for the guarantee. The Welsh Government has been working even more with our universities to strengthen international links for the benefits of researchers, institutions, economic regions and the nation as a whole. We have funded the British Council to develop, deliver and evaluation a mobility programme focussing on providing a wider range of opportunities, for example to Vietnam for those young people from deprived areas where take up has generally been lower. We are keen to learn from best practice around the world and crucially to share our areas of expertise with those who can learn from us. These exchanges can be mutually beneficial to both participating countries.

Teacher Recruitment

We anticipate limited impact in terms of teacher supply from Brexit. Currently the EWC are able to register teachers from the European Union who wish to practice in Wales (providing their qualifications and QTS is comparable to Wales’ requirements) and we have put in place measures to enable this to continue in the event of a No Deal Brexit with ‘The Teachers’ Qualifications (Amendment) (Wales) (EU Exit) Regulations 2019” that we have laid. These provide for the arrangements to continue and further, in the event of a No-Deal exit, enable Welsh Ministers to consider (in the same way as we consider applications from EU nations) the qualifications of teachers from other nations. In the event of a deal we have the transition period where things are pretty much status quo, and assuming no changes are required following the transition period these amendments to regulations can be brought into force (in a lift and shift arrangement).

Guidance has been prepared for schools on Brexit issues and includes the paragraphs below:

- Currently EU, EEA EFTA and Swiss qualified teachers have the right to have their professional status and qualifications considered for the award of Qualified Teacher Status in Wales. EU EEA EFTA and Swiss professionals whose qualifications have been recognised before the exit date, or who have applied for a recognition decision before that time, will retain this right in a no deal exit. There will be no retrospective change for people who have already had their EU, EEA EFTA and Swiss professional status and qualifications recognised and been awarded Qualified Teacher Status in Wales.
- In a No Deal scenario, the current system of reciprocal recognition of professional qualifications between the EU, EEA EFTA and Switzerland and the UK will not apply after the exit date. This does not affect those who have already had their qualifications recognised in the UK or have applied for a recognition decision before the exit date.

- After we leave the EU, we will ensure that professionals with EU EEA EFTA or Swiss qualifications, including teachers, will still have a means to seek recognition of their professional qualifications through a new system. Further information will be published shortly on GOV.UK.
- The arrangements above are without prejudice to the rights and privileges accorded, by virtue of the Common Travel Area, to Irish and UK citizens when in each other's state.

Question 5: *Please can you confirm that the Wales as a trilingual nation policy continues to be endorsed by the Welsh Government.*

Response: The 'Bilingual plus 1' strategy was announced in 2015 as part of the Global Futures 5-year plan to help reverse the UK-wide decline in the take up of modern foreign languages (MFL) in Wales.

Concerns have been raised however that some schools are interpreting 'Bilingual plus 1' literally, based on the erroneous assumption that 'plus one' indicates the offer of a single modern language only, to the exclusion of a second or more modern languages in schools in Wales. We have clarified with all stakeholders that, it is neither the intention nor the stated aim of the 'Bilingual plus 1' strategy for schools to limit the choice of modern languages offered to a single language. Such limitation would run contrary to the ethos of *Global Futures*, which seeks to support and broaden, rather than narrow, language learning and language diversity in the curriculum.

Languages are an essential element in realising the four purposes of the new *Curriculum for Wales*. The new curriculum will bring together Welsh, English and International Languages in the Languages, Literacy and Communication (LLC) Area of Learning and Experience (AOLE). The term International Languages will be used to encompass modern languages, community languages, classical languages and British Sign Language (BSL). Learners will develop from showing an awareness of the languages and cultures around them at school and in the community to showing an understanding of multicultural societies and plurilingualism both here in Wales and across the world. Progression in an International Language will be shown from Progression Step 3 (by the end of primary school). The draft curriculum proposes that all learners will have opportunities to learn at least one international language alongside Welsh and English and this will replace the 'bilingual plus one' strategy. Skills and knowledge in listening and reading, speaking and writing and in literature developed in one language support their development in another language, no matter which language came first.

Yours sincerely,



Eluned Morgan AC/AM

Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Chysylltiadau Rhyngwladol
Minister for International Relations and the Welsh Language

Lord Dafydd Elis-Thomas AM

Deputy Minister for Culture, Tourism and Sport

Welsh Government

30 April 2019

Dear Dafydd,

I am copying to you the [exchange of letters](#) between myself and Rhodri Talfan Davies regarding the BBC's proposal to request that Ofcom remove the requirement for 100% speech content for radio stations between 07.30 and 08.30 on weekdays.

I feel that any change to the requirement for 100% speech content in this early morning slot would be a step backwards. Listeners in Wales tune into BBC Radio broadcasts in greater numbers than in any other UK nation. They should expect to hear a discussion of the political and current events which shape their lives.

I am not convinced of the BBC's argument that their request to Ofcom is intended 'to give individual radio station right across the UK the flexibility at breakfast to respond to changing patterns of listening'. The BBC has said that 'there is no plan for BBC Radio Wales or BBC Radio Cymru to change their current news focus in peak'. However, once the requirement for 100% speech content is removed for this slot it will result in a loss of a protected time in radio broadcasting dedicated to information and discussion rather than entertainment.

Please can you let me know if the Welsh Government has had any communication with BBC Wales or Ofcom on this matter? Can I have your reassurance that the Welsh Government also opposes this request to Ofcom by BBC Wales? I am sure you will agree that any reduction of speech content

in this slot would deprive the people of Wales of an important means of understanding the decisions which have the most impact on their lives.

Please could you respond to me by 29 May so that I can inform our stakeholders of the Welsh Government's position on this issue,

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Bethan Sayed".

Bethan Sayed

Chair of the Committee

Agenda Item 4.3

Lord Dafydd Elis-Thomas AM

Deputy Minister for Culture, Tourism and Sport

Welsh Government

2 April 2019

Dear Dafydd,

National Librarian for Wales recruitment exercise

The National Library is one of the Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies which fall under the remit of the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee. As part of our role in scrutinising the Library's performance, I am obviously keen to ensure its leadership team is able to provide the vision and responsiveness required in today's challenging times for the public sector, and heritage organisations in particular.

The recent recruitment exercise for a successor to Linda Tomos, the National Librarian for Wales has raised some concerning issues which I would like to examine.

I have seen the email exchanges between the Human Resources Department in the Library and officials in the Welsh Government's Museums, Archives and Libraries Division. These emails were released to Cymdeithas yr Iaith under the Freedom of Information Act.

The content of the emails seem to suggest that you, as Deputy Minister for Culture, Tourism and Sport, sought, through your officials, to determine the wording of the job advertisement before it was published, by insisting that the job criteria should specify Welsh language speaking skills were 'highly desirable' rather than 'essential'. I am of the view, as was the President of the Library, that your intervention went beyond the boundaries of your role as set out in the Framework Document between the Welsh Government and the Library. The Framework requires the Government to be consulted on the appointment process, but does not require a Minister's approval for the advertisement before being published.

I accept that your intention was to ensure as wide a pool of candidates as possible, but your interventions and subsequent attempt to delay the publication of the advertisement raises serious concerns about propriety and accountability.

As Chair of the Committee, I am keen to ensure the Library can fulfil its remit as they see fit, and that the Welsh Government is not unduly influencing, or interfering in, the day to day operations of their work.


Working relationship with arms-length bodies

The emails do not portray a constructive working relationship and I am concerned this may have an adverse impact on the Library's ability to deliver its remit.

I am disappointed that political pressure is being used in this way. The people of Wales are entitled to expect their Government to trust an arms-length bodies to carry out its role without interference from the Deputy Minister.

I would be grateful if you could respond to my concerns in writing by 26 April.

Yours sincerely,



Bethan Sayed

Chair of the Committee



Ein cyf/Our ref: MA-p-DET-1625-19

Bethan Sayed AM
Chair
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Tŷ Hywel
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA

1 May 2019

Dear Bethan

Thank you for your letter dated 2 April.

Your letter refers to my part in the process of appointing the new Chief Executive of the National Library. This issue was also raised by the Leader of Plaid Cymru in a recent letter to the First Minister, and if I may, I will refer you to his conclusions on this matter.

Having investigated, the First Minister concluded that 'the Welsh Government has a legitimate role in the process of appointing a new Chief Executive because under the prevailing Framework Agreement, the Library was obliged to consult the Welsh Government about its proposals'.

He added that it was *'entirely appropriate for the Deputy Minister to have a view on those proposals and to ask for that view to be conveyed to the National Library'*. He also noted that *'no complaint has been received from the National Library that it feels it has been the subject of inappropriate behaviour, at either official or ministerial level'*.

You also state that the emails released under the FoI request from Cymdeithas yr Iaith 'do not portray a constructive working relationship' between the Welsh Government and the National Library, and that you are 'concerned this may have an adverse impact on the National Library's ability to deliver its remit'. I can assure you that the working relationship is constructive, as some recent events serve to illustrate:

- The very constructive meeting I held at the Library on 14 February, with the President, the then Chief Librarian, and the new Chief Librarian (designate).
- On the same day, the positive discussions I held on-site with the President, and senior staff, about the scope to restore the Gregynog Gallery. The Library wishes to refurbish the gallery, and return it to its original size. I hope to make an announcement about this project very shortly.

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay
Caerdydd • Cardiff
CF99 1NA

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre:
0300 0604400

Gohebiaeth.Dafydd.Elis-Thomas@llyw.cymru
Correspondence.Dafydd.Elis-Thomas@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

- The recent public appointment interviews for new Trustees, and a new Vice-President. These involved the Library's President, and two of my senior officials, alongside an independent member. I await their recommendations, but understand that to date the process has been very positive and collaborative.
- My recent decision (14 April) to award an extra £1.325 million in capital funding to the Library, over the next two years (2020-2022).

I and my officials are fully committed to ensuring that this positive relationship continues.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. Elis-Thomas'.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas AC/AM

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth
Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism